

<mark>research</mark> p<mark>rogram on</mark> Fish

Led by WorldFish

# Increasing social and ecological resilience of coastal fisheries

More than 775 million people have high dependence on marine ecosystems for nutritional, economic and coastal protection benefits,<sup>1</sup> including via small-scale fisheries. Small-scale fisheries, of which around two thirds are marine, produce almost half the fish consumed in low- and middleincome countries and directly employ 60 million people, with a further 53 million fishing for subsistence purposes.<sup>2</sup> With appropriate governance, coastal fisheries contribute to and can improve the well-being, food and nutrition security, and livelihoods of millions of people. However, the resilience of coastal fisheries and well-being of coastal communities is undermined by distal (e.g. climate change, geopolitics) and proximate (e.g. unsustainable fishing, land use changes) drivers. Research that develops technical, social and institutional innovations within specific contexts can help build adaptive capacity and enhance sustainability when also accompanied by improved regional, national and local governance.

The CGIAR Research Program on Fish Agri-Food Systems (FISH) aimed to increase resilience in (i) the reef-dominated fisheries of **small island, large ocean, Pacific nations**, (ii) the nearshore pelagic and reef fisheries of **island Asia, particularly Timor-Leste**, and (iii) the transnational river-coastal **hilsa fisheries of Bangladesh and Myanmar**.<sup>3</sup> Across these distinct fisheries systems, FISH aimed to

- 1. improve comanagement models for equity, nutrition and social-ecological resilience;
- 2. develop and scale livelihood improvement strategies;
- 3. understand and manage distal drivers and trade-offs along coasts alongside new knowledge on values of small-scale fisheries.

# Tailored comanagement innovations for enhanced equity, nutrition and social-ecological resilience

Comanagement is a human-rights based approach to govern resources that ensures formal government is involved in inclusive and transparent decision-making processes with resource users.

### Key messages

- Small-scale coastal capture fisheries produce almost half the fish consumed in low- and middle- income countries and employ more people than all other ocean economic sectors combined, but their resilience is undermined by distal and proximate drivers.
- Comanagement of small-scale coastal and inland fisheries contributes to social, economic and environmental objectives, but evidence and outcomes for gender equity, nutrition and social-ecological gains are lacking. Methodological, technical and governance innovations (e.g. handbooks for gender equity and social inclusion, fish aggregating devices, compensation schemes for fishery closures) can help progress these outcomes.
- Participatory diagnostic tools that harness voices from local organizations, coastal communities and women's groups can guide sustainable and appropriate improvements to fish-based livelihoods.
- Increasingly on coasts, the scale of changes or shocks exceed the reach or impact of comanagement or local livelihood interventions. Structural adjustments or responses must be well informed to navigate trade-offs in response.

Comanagement is a mainstream approach to govern smallscale fisheries and is supported by multiple global, regional and national voluntary and binding policies. The Illuminating Hidden Harvest Initiative, of which FISH is a partner, found that more than one-third of small-scale fisheries are governed with provisions for comanagement.<sup>2</sup> Comanagement contributes positively to a range of social, economic and environmental objectives, yet evidence and outcomes toward gender equity, food and nutrition security, and medium-term ecological or productivity gains have been lacking. FISH focused on addressing these weaknesses by developing a bundle of innovations for more inclusive and effective models of comanagement. FISH worked where institutional support for comanagement is only just emerging (Timor-Leste, Myanmar) and by improving comanagement where it is established and scaling (Cambodia, Bangladesh, the Pacific).

To mitigate the documented risk that comanagement can exacerbate inequities and power imbalances, FISH and partners developed a gender-inclusive guide for facilitation, gendersensitive facilitation techniques for field research, a framework and methodology for assessing inclusion, and handbooks for gender equity and social inclusion in coastal fisheries management and community engagement. These resources are incorporated as guides for gender inclusion in large investments in Pacific coastal fisheries and global initiatives for coral reef management. FISH and partners also addressed technical cases of exclusion, including the persistent underrepresentation of women and their labor in fisheries data that perpetuates women's exclusion from fisheries governance. To fill this data gap, FISH collected empirical data on labor, income and food contributions women make through their pre-harvest, harvest and post-harvest roles.<sup>2</sup> For example, FISH found women in Timor-Leste are actively fishing more days per month than men, and mainly through gleaning. A National Women's Fisher Forum brought women from dispersed fishing communities across Timor-Leste together to share their stories and data to strengthen representation of their fisheries and views in national governance, policies and emergent models of comanagement. Similarly, in Bangladesh, guotas contributed to women and their interests being represented in comanagement decision-making in more than 136 fishing communities.<sup>4</sup>

Comanagement helps secure and sustain local supplies of fish and other aquatic foods, yet improving nutrition requires a suite of complementary innovations. In Timor-Leste, FISH piloted technologies to increase access to fisheries resources using fish aggregating devices from which fishers experienced increased catch rates of nutrient-rich pelagic species. This technical innovation was paired with social and behavior change to test impacts on fish consumption and diets among inland and upland communities, who experience the highest rates of malnutrition and low access to fish. Contribution to national nutrition targets will likely require complementary public investment into fish distribution infrastructure and engagement with influential, local actors and their existing networks in established supply chains. In Bangladesh, nutrient-rich small indigenous fish species were dried and made into fish powder to be distributed in fishing communities during periods of fishery closures<sup>5</sup> to maintain and improve nutrition in the first 1000 days of life and for women of reproductive age.

Across FISH geographies, new biological and ecological insights of fished species have led to management changes toward improved sustainability. In Bangladesh, estimates reveal effective management of the hilsa fisheries would be worth up to USD 356 million annually. In pursuit of better management, spatial and temporal closures to the hilsa fishery were designed and implemented using new insights on species biology and ecology. These closures led to greater productivity and fisheries yields<sup>5</sup> and provided opportunities to build resilience.<sup>5,6</sup> Nonetheless, the costs of closures remain substantial for small-scale fishers, suggesting further work on management adaptations and appropriate compensation are necessary. FISH estimated the value of Myanmar's artisanal hilsa fishery at USD 730-870 million, and recommended that to increase efficiency, sustainability and equity within the fishery, a system of revenue collection from high-earning supply chain actors should be introduced to generate funds for fishers in the form of compliance incentives and compensation for fisheries management regulations. Due to civil unrest, these institutional adjustments remain unimplemented.



FISH developed novel indicators to evaluate partial fishery closures, the most common management measure applied within Pacific comanagement. Findings show increased productivity, elevated harvesting efficiency, and altered species composition of catches, suggesting management delivered benefits to fishers but elevated risk of resource decline.<sup>7</sup> Combined with community fishery profiles and a decade of participatory fisheries monitoring in Solomon Islands, recommendations to guide periodicity and intensity of harvests based on life history traits of fished species were developed.<sup>8</sup> Piloting low-cost, technological advances, FISH's digital catch monitoring and automated analytics system, PeskAAS, similarly improved near real-time data flow to fishers and fishery managers to support management decisions. Successful pilots have supported the full integration of PeskAAS into Timor-Leste's national fisheries management.

# Bundled innovations for improving coastal fisheries livelihoods

In Timor-Leste and Solomon Islands, FISH partnered with community groups to pilot a diagnostic tool for sustainable livelihoods improvement. The tool guided participatory evaluations of livelihood feasibility and identification of training and resource needs and other potential barriers, and it has been adopted by the Pacific Community as a best practice. Livelihood improvements included the establishment of women's microenterprises in Timor-Leste and installation of solar-powered freezers in Solomon Islands.

Further opportunities to preserve quality and extend distribution were identified. In Bangladesh, community saving groups and alternative income generating activities were similarly focused on women and increased their access to, and control over, economic assets—and appeared to improve economic resilience in the face of the COVID-19 pandemic. Income generation opportunities were piloted within a broader well-being approach with conditions and services necessary for safe and decent livelihoods, food and nutrition security, and individual and social wellness. Preliminary positive outcomes have encouraged the Government of Bangladesh to commit to scaling this well-being approach in 100 villages.<sup>5</sup>

To ensure that initiatives are increasingly gender-sensitive and not singularly focused on women, FISH used the GENNOVATE methodology to identify gendered livelihood opportunities and barriers.<sup>9,10</sup> In collaboration with CARE International, FISH developed a good practice guide and policy recommendations for advancing gender equality in coastal livelihoods. This guidance is positioned to be used by the Coral Reef Rescue Initiative, which may impact up to 30 million fishers who are reliant on coral reefs.



FISH research reiterated three pathways for improving livelihoods: (i) revitalize Indigenous knowledge and stewardship, (ii) foster comanagement and (iii) empower women.<sup>11</sup> These lessons reinforce the concept that livelihood improvements can be addressed by technical and financial improvements only when delivered with attention to individual and societal barriers and aspirations.

# New knowledge to navigate opportunities and trade-offs in response to global change

To be resilient, management, livelihoods and food systems must anticipate and adapt to risks and opportunities that emerge, even at a distance. FISH examined global and structural drivers and shocks, the nature and limits of adaptive capacity, and equitable governance responses, particularly under climate change and COVID-19. FISH identified the social determinants of adaptive and transformative responses to climate change and exposed the assumptions that perpetuate gender inequities in climate responses. FISH developed a novel approach to understand and build adaptive capacity in coastal systems and other fisheries settings. Yet FISH investment in climate change adaptation in coastal settings was modest relative to the scale and scope of impact, and it requires greater, urgent attention in future programming. The onset of COVID-19 tested the flexibility of the adaptive capacity framework, which was applied during the COVID-19 pandemic using responsible, remote, qualitative research methods to illuminate the lived experiences of coastal communities and fish supply chain actors in Ghana, Kenya, Papua New Guinea, Solomon Islands and across sub-Saharan Africa, complementing the insights on fish production volumes and price.

In Bangladesh, 84 percent of fisheries landings come from small-scale, artisanal fisheries, but industrial and illegal fishing increasingly encroach on small-scale fishing grounds and resources. An influx of 1.1 million refugees in the Bay of Bengal presents a humanitarian crisis in and of itself, but it has also intensified pressures on coastal fisheries resources and competition for livelihoods. Here, FISH plays a brokering role, bringing fisher groups together with government actors to raise concerns and identify required actions, including strengthening enforcement of new regulations dividing smallscale and industrial fisheries zones at the 40 m depth contour. The geopolitical, demographic and economic shifts in the Bay of Bengal are increasingly pertinent to other coastal areas and demonstrate the need to build governance capacity across levels and sectors to effectively navigate instability and change. The power and pace of interests in conservation or economic development of coastal areas intensify risks and trade-offs between the conservation, economic gains, food and nutrition security and well-being of coastal communities. FISH examined these trade-offs and synergies and identified, for example, where economic gains from international fish trade were prioritized at the cost of nutritional needs of coastal communities. From empirical perspectives of communities confronting change, FISH also developed new insights on environmental justice in coastal systems. This was reflected in FISH contributions to the High Level Panel for a Sustainable Ocean Economy, arguing that *"a sustainable ocean economy should protect human rights, improve human well-being, stimulate inclusion and gender equity, and prioritise recognition, diversity and equal access to resources..."* 

Powerful marine actors signal increased sensitivity to human rights, food and nutrition security, and gender equity, yet concerns about the integrity and impact of their approaches remain—particularly among civil society groups and social movements representing fishers and fish workers. With SwedBio, the Food and Agriculture Organization, and the Small-Scale Fisheries Global Strategic Framework Advisory Group, FISH hosted a series of webinars to increase capacity and mutual understanding among environmental nongovernmental organizations, marine funders and civil society in relation to the Voluntary Guidelines for Securing Sustainable Small-Scale Fisheries in the Context of Food Security and Poverty Eradication, human rights-based approaches, gender equality, and climate change and disasters. Exchanges on similar topics have been facilitated in many FISH focal countries, and global dialogues will continue throughout the International Year of Artisanal Fisheries.

## **Future directions**

## **Policy and investment**

FISH delivered a range of findings and innovations that promote more effective fisheries management and more inclusive governance of coasts in transition. The translation to more enabling policy environments is emerging,<sup>12</sup> but requires sustained attention and longer evaluation timeframes.

Preserving the social, ecological and economic values of rural and coastal social-ecological systems necessitates better and more equitable access to information and services for women and men, improving peer-to-peer learning to foster innovation, and building cross-level accountability and response by public and private sectors.

Mounting pressure on coastal systems necessitates continued commitment to (i) sustaining the resource base upon which these livelihood and food values are built, (ii) enabling coastal actors to continue their roles in ensuring fish agri-food systems deliver positive outcomes, and (ii) ensuring the broader well-being, food and nutrition security, livelihood aspirations, and tenure rights for coastal communities. Policy and investments that also commit, and genuinely adhere, to principles of upward and downward accountability, knowledge co-production, inclusive and equitable governance, and open dialogue to navigate trade-offs transparently are all critical.

## **Future research**

Both legacy strengths and funding restrictions led FISH to focus efforts on coastal fishery systems of Asia and the Pacific. For these regions and coral coasts of Africa, we propose a series of research priorities for sustainable tropical seascapes through co-produced research and learning.<sup>13</sup> However, many other regions, including West Africa, depend heavily on marine systems and experience intense inequities within coastal fishery systems. FISH contributed

important, modest knowledge gains on COVID-19 impacts on small-scale fisheries in Ghana and small-scale fishery values in Nigeria, as well as fish trade adjustments to address nutrient deficiencies in West African coastal populations. Research on and embedded into the policy processes in which insights can be enacted will likely stimulate improved management, food and nutrition security, and livelihood outcomes from and for coastal social-ecological systems. This research agenda should include increased attention to scaling processes and outcomes, building on the novel scaling framework FISH developed to understand the diffusion of rights, equity and justice. Further research on the values and limits of local coastal economies and food systems in the face of the emerging Blue Economy and the impacts of climate change would support equitable and inclusive governance oriented toward attainment of the Sustainable Development Goals.

### Notes

- <sup>1</sup> Selig ER, Hole DG, Allison EH, Arkema KK, McKinnon MC, Chu J, de Sherbinin A, Fisher B, Gallagher L, Holland MB et al. 2018. Mapping global human dependence on marine ecosystems. *Conservation Letters* 309:e12617. doi: 10.1111/conl.12617
- <sup>2</sup> FAO, Duke University and WorldFish. In press. Illuminating hidden harvests: The contribution of small-scale fisheries to sustainable development. Rome: FAO.
- <sup>3</sup> Hilsa (*Tenualosa ilisha*) is Bangladesh's most important single-species fishery and one of Myanmar's most exported wild caught fish.
- <sup>4</sup> Abdul W, Rahman M, Haque ABM and Nahiduzzaman M. 2020. USAID Enhanced Coastal Fisheries in Bangladesh Project (ECOFISH): Completion Report (2014-2019). https://hdl.handle.net/20.500.12348/4543
- <sup>5</sup> Rahman MJ, Wahab MA, Nahiduzzaman M, Haque ABM and Cohen PJ. 2020. Hilsa fishery management in Bangladesh. *Earth and Environmental Science* 414:012018. doi: 10.1088/1755-1315/414/1/012018
- Authors

Alexander Tilley,<sup>1</sup> Philippa J. Cohen,<sup>1</sup> Michael Akester,<sup>1</sup> Margaret Batalofo,<sup>1</sup> Delvene Boso,<sup>1</sup> Joshua Cinner,<sup>2</sup> Joctan Dos Reis Lopes,<sup>1</sup> Agustinha Duarte,<sup>1</sup> Hampus Eriksson,<sup>13</sup> Chelcia Gomese,<sup>1</sup> Ruby Grantham,<sup>2</sup> Kim Hunnam,<sup>5</sup> Firoz Khan,<sup>1</sup> Danika Kleiber,<sup>14</sup> Jacqueline Lau,<sup>2</sup> Sarah Lawless,<sup>2</sup> ABM Mahfuzul Haque,<sup>1</sup> David Mills,<sup>1</sup> Tiffany H. Morrison,<sup>2</sup> Md. Nahiduzzaman,<sup>1</sup> Anna Patel,<sup>1</sup> Mario Pereira,<sup>1</sup> Jalilur Rahman,<sup>1</sup> Anouk Ride,<sup>1</sup> Janet Saeni-Oeta,<sup>1</sup> Patrick Smallhorn-West,<sup>2</sup> Meshach Sukulu,<sup>1</sup> Faye Siota,<sup>1</sup> Md. Hadayet Ullah,<sup>1</sup> Abdul Wahab,<sup>1</sup> Regon Warren,<sup>1</sup> Tasnuva Zaman,<sup>1</sup> Malcolm C. M. Beveridge,<sup>1</sup> Nisha Marwaha<sup>1</sup> and Michael Phillips.<sup>1</sup>

#### Affiliations

- <sup>1</sup> WorldFish
- <sup>2</sup> James Cook University <sup>3</sup> University of Wollongong
- <sup>3</sup> University of Wollongong <sup>4</sup> National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration
- <sup>5</sup> Charles Darwin University

#### Acknowledgments

This strategic brief is published by the CGIAR Research Program on Fish Agri-Food Systems (FISH), led by WorldFish in partnership with the International Water Management Institute, Wageningen University & Research, James Cook University and the University of Greenwich. FISH is a multidisciplinary research for development program designed in collaboration with partners and stakeholders to develop and implement research innovations that enhance the contribution of small-scale fisheries and aquaculture to reducing poverty, increasing food and nutrition security, and improving natural resource systems. Please visit fish.cgiar.org for more information.

This brief is one in a series of synthesis products published in 2021 to share learnings, outcomes and impacts from the FISH program. It is intended to stimulate actions and investments into fish and aquatic foods to realize their role in the transformation of food, land and water systems in a climate crisis. We extend thanks to all the contributors of this research and the reviewers of this brief.

- <sup>6</sup> Béné C and Haque MABM. 2021. Strengthening the resilience of vulnerable communities: Results from a quasi-experimental impact evaluation in coastal Bangladesh. *The European Journal of Development Research*, 1–26. doi: 10.1057/s41287-021-00399-9
- <sup>7</sup> Smallhorn-West P, Cohen PJ, Morais R, Januchowski-Hartley F, Ceccarelli D, Malimali S, Stone K, Warren R and Cinner J. In press. Hidden benefits and risks of partial protection for coral reef fisheries. *Ecology and Society*.
- <sup>8</sup> Smallhorn-West P, van der Ploeg J, Boso D, Sukulu M, Leamae J, Hagi R, Ishihanua M, Jasper M, Saeni-Oeta J, Batalofo M et al. In press. Patterns of catch and trophic signatures illustrate diverse management requirements of coastal fisheries at island scale in Solomon Islands. *Ambio*.
- <sup>9</sup> Locke C, Muljono P, McDougall C and Morgan M. 2017. Innovation and gendered negotiations: Insights from six small-scale fishing communities. *Fish and Fisheries* 18:943–57. doi: 10.1111/faf.12216
- <sup>10</sup> Lawless S, Cohen PJ, McDougall C, Orirana G, Siota F and Doyle K. 2019. Gender norms and relations: Implications for agency in coastal livelihoods. *Maritime Studies* 18:347–58. doi: 10.1007/s40152-019-00147-0
- <sup>11</sup> Eriksson H, Blythe JL, Österblom H and Olsson P. 2021. Beyond social-ecological traps: fostering transformations towards sustainability. Ecology and Society 26(1):13. doi: 10.5751/ES-12198-260113
- <sup>12</sup> Ratner BD, Dubois M, Morrison T, Tezzo X, Song A, Mbaru EK, Chimatiro S and Cohen PJ. In press. A framework to guide research engagement in the policy process, with application to small-scale fisheries. *Ecology and Society*.
- <sup>13</sup> Cumming GS, Adamska M, Barnes M, Barnett J, Bellwood D, Cinner J, Cohen P, Donelson J, Fabricius K, Grafton Q et al. In prep. Research priorities for sustainable tropical seascapes.

#### This is a contribution to the following:



### Citation

This publication should be cited as: Tilley A, Cohen PJ, Akester M, Batalofo M, Boso D, Cinner J, Dos Reis Lopes J, Duarte A, Eriksson H, Gomese C et al. 2021. Increasing social and ecological resilience of coastal fisheries. Penang, Malaysia: CGIAR Research Program on Fish Agri-Food Systems. Program Brief: FISH-2021-24.

### **Creative Commons License**



Content in this publication is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (CC BY-NC 4.0), which permits non-commercial use, including reproduction, adaptation and distribution of the publication provided the original work is properly cited.

© 2021 CGIAR Research Program on Fish Agri-Food Systems.